National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee
Federal Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes
April 25, 2023

The National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee (NAIAC) held a public meeting on Tuesday, April 25, 2023, in Washington, DC.

Committee Members:
- Miriam Vogel, Chair
- James Manyika, Vice Chair
- Yll Bajraktari (virtual)
- Amanda Ballantyne
- Sayan Chakraborty
- Jack Clark (virtual)
- David Danks (virtual)
- Victoria Espinel
- Paula Goldman
- Susan Gonzales
- Janet Haven
- Daniel Ho
- Ayanna Howard (virtual)

- Jon Kleinberg (virtual)
- Ramayya Krishnan
- Ashley Llorens
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian
- Christina Montgomery
- Liz O'Sullivan
- Fred Oswald
- Frank Pasquale (virtual)
- Trooper Sanders
- Navrina Singh
- Swami Sivasubramanian
- Keith Strier
- Reggie Townsend

NIST Staff Members Present:
- Alicia Jayson, NIST
- Kathy Pham, NIST
- Elham Tabassi, NIST

- Melissa Taylor, NIST
- Rachel Trello, (acting) Designated Federal Officer (DFO), NIST

Meeting Minutes

Opening Remarks
- The Designated Federal Officer called the meeting to order at 10:00 AM eastern time and confirmed the committee is operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act and accessible to the public via livestream.

- Director of NIST and Under Secretary of Commerce for Standards and Technology welcomed the members and thanked them for their service to the NAIAC throughout the year. Dr. Locascio emphasized the timely nature of the Committee's work and the significant benefits, risks and opportunities of AI. Locascio also discussed NIST's continued commitment to work with the community to conduct research, develop technically sound standards, interoperable evaluations and benchmarks, and usable practice guides.

- The NAIAC Committee Chair, Miriam Vogel, contextualized the recent global awareness of AI's impact and shift in the global landscape, emphasizing the risks and benefits of AI, as well as the need for thoughtful consideration to mitigate potential negative consequences while maintaining American competitiveness. Vogel went on to summarize the Committee's efforts to develop its

first year report, emphasizing that the document was consensus-driven and intended to highlight the most critical issues to the President and the White House.

Working Group Chair Report-Out
- The NAIAC working group chairs reported their groups efforts over the past year and discussed their group's contribution to the report.

U.S. Leadership and Competitiveness
- The U.S. Leadership and Competitiveness working group discussed the working group's objectives and process, noting the groups focus on improving government organization for the age of AI.
- The working group met with AI experts inside and outside of government and included recommendations to improve existing efforts within the White House, which include building and enhancing current government efforts already underway.

Leadership in Trustworthy Artificial Intelligence
- The Leadership in Trustworthy Artificial Intelligence working group emphasized that the success of AI depends on public trust and confidence as well as the ability for AI to benefit everyone broadly.
- The working group chair summarized the working groups efforts to develop recommendations that support and operationalize trustworthy AI in the U.S. government, bolstering AI leadership in the U.S. Government, supporting small and medium sized businesses, and supporting civil rights entities.

Leadership in Research & Development
- The Leadership in Research and Development working group, discussed their recommendations to strengthen the U.S. R&D ecosystem.
- The working group chair summarized the working group's recommendations, emphasizing the importance of sociotechnical research on AI and the need for the U.S. government to foster, track, and invest in broadly beneficial research.

Supporting the U.S. Workforce and Providing Opportunity:
- The U.S. Workforce and Providing Opportunity working group discussed the day-to-day impact AI will have on the nature of work in the U.S.
- The working group chair went on to summarize the working group's recommendations, noting that the federal government should accelerate efforts to modernize the data used in decision making, understand new types of work that are currently not captured by current data, and keep individuals at the center of focus.

International Cooperation:
- The International Coordination working group reiterated the Committee's goals to maintain U.S. competitiveness and global leadership in AI, noting the need to continue engagement with allies and strategic partners.

- The working group chair went on to highlight the dynamic nature of international cooperation, emphasizing the continual need for sharing, listening, debating, synchronizing, and harmonizing approaches across AI domains.

NAIAC Member Discussion
- Each NAIAC Member was invited to share their individual perspectives. See the recording for detailed member perspectives.
- Core themes included emphasis on:
    - A US AI Strategy that is responsive to the unprecedented acceleration of AI technology development and adoption;
    - Cultivating socio technical research on trustworthy and responsible AI through funding and research partnerships;
    - A call for approaches to AI that are inclusive and understanding of the potential harms AI can have on the workforce, and giving those in traditionally underserved or underrepresented communities an opportunity to participate in the discussion on AI .
    - Modernizing government infrastructure to improve the quality data used to inform decision making.

Committee Vote to Advance the Year-1 Report
- Each Member of the Committee was polled and decided by majority vote to advance the Committee's year-one report to the President.

Miriam Vogel - Yes	Jon Kleinberg - Yes
James Manyika - Yes	Ramayya Krishnan - Yes
Yll Bajraktari - Yes	Ashley Llorens - Yes
Amanda Ballantyne - Abstained	Haniyeh Mahmoudian - Yes
Sayan Chakraborty - Yes	Christina Montgomery - Yes
Jack Clark - Yes	Liz O'Sullivan - No
David Danks - Yes	Fred Oswald - Yes
Victoria Espinel - Yes	Frank Pasquale - Yes
Paula Goldman - Yes	Trooper Sanders - Yes
Susan Gonzales - Yes	Navrina Singh - Yes
Janet Haven - Yes	Swami Sivasubramanian - Yes
Daniel Ho - Yes	Keith Strier - Yes
Ayanna Howard – Yes	Reggie Townsend - Yes

Yes: 24 | No: 1 | Abstained: 1

NAIAC Member Discussion on Year Two Objectives
The Committee Members discussed the committee's objectives for year-two and the establishment of new working groups. Working group topic areas to include:
- education and AI;
- continuing efforts on work and workforce;
- generative AI;
- international coordination;
- human rights, inclusion, and disability in AI;
- AI regulation, executive action, broader engagement.

Comments and Closing Remarks

- Secretary of Commerce, Gina Raimondo, expressed gratitude to the NAIAC for their efforts and acknowledged the urgency of the Committee's work. Secretary Raimondo discussed the challenges presented by the recent acceleration of AI and expressed optimism for the benefits of AI. Secretary Raimondo went on to urge the Committee to consider increasing the number of Committee outputs to match the rapid pace of innovation.

- The Federal Register notice produced no public questions and comments. The Committee opened the floor to audience questions virtually and in-person. Please see recording for public comments.

- The Designated Federal Officer adjourned the meeting at 1:26 pm Eastern Time.