

**National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee
Briefing Minutes
June 22, 2023**

The National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee (NAIAC) held a virtual public briefing on Thursday, June 22, 2023. The briefing was recorded and is [available online](#).

NAIAC Committee Members:

- Miriam Vogel, Chair
- Amanda Ballantyne
- David Danks
- Susan Gonzales
- Janet Haven
- Jon Kleinberg
- Ramayya Krishnan
- Ashley Llorens
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian
- Christina Montgomery
- Liz O’Sullivan

Law Enforcement Subcommittee Members:

- Jane Baumbauer, Chair
- Armando Aguilar
- Esha Bhandari

NIST Staff Members Present

- Kathy Pham, NIST
- Melissa Taylor, NIST
- Rachel Trello, (acting) Designated Federal Officer (DFO), NIST

Invited Briefers

- Olga Akselrod, Senior Staff Attorney, American Civil Liberties Union
- Quinn Anex-Rios, Policy Associate, Lawyers Committee for Civil Rights under Law
- Alexandra Givens, Center for Democracy and Technology
- Vinhcent Le, Senior Legal Counsel, Greenlining Institute
- Tawana Petty, Director of Policy and Advocacy, Algorithmic Justice League
- Hannah Sassaman, Executive Director, Peoples Tech Project
- Amalea Smirniotopoulos, Senior Policy Counsel, National Association for the Advancement for Colored People
- Anna Tumadottir, Deputy CEO and COO of Creative Commons

Meeting Minutes

Opening Remarks

- The Designated Federal Officer called the meeting to order at 2:03 PM eastern time and confirmed the committee is operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act and accessible to the public via livestream.
- NAIAC Executive Director, Kathy Pham, welcomed Briefing Session two participants and explained the goal of NAIAC: to provide advice to the President of the United States and the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative Office on matters related to the National Artificial

Intelligence Initiative. Pham added that biographical information of members of the newly-formed Law Enforcement Subcommittee can be found at www.ai.gov/naiac

- Miriam Vogel (Chair) outlined the reformulated working groups and subcommittees and leadership supporting NAIAC's efforts for Year 2, including: AI Futures: Sustaining Innovation in NextGen AI (led by Ramayya Krishnan and Haniyeh Mahmoudian); AI in Work and the Workforce (led by Trooper Sanders); AI Regulation and Executive Action (led by Dan Ho and Victoria Espinel); Engagement, Education and Inclusion (led by Reggie Townsend and Susan Gonzales); Generative and NextGen AI: Safety and Assurance (led by Paula Goldman and David Danks); Rights-Respecting AI (led by Janet Haven and Liz O'Sullivan); and International Arena: Collaboration on AI Policy and AI-Enabled Solutions (led by Victoria Espinel).

Presenter Remarks

- Presenters were invited to give three minutes of prepared remarks to the Committee. Each of the presenter's remarks may be viewed in full in the accompanying recording of the briefing. ([Watch Remarks](#))
 - **Tawana Petty**, Director of Policy and Advocacy, Algorithmic Justice League provided examples of current and emerging harms from the use of biometric surveillance and suggested recommendations for the Committee to consider in order to course correct ongoing algorithmic discrimination.
 - **Olga Akselrod**, Senior Staff Attorney, American Civil Liberties Union suggested several recommendations for the NAIAC to consider, including recommendations that ensure civil rights and liberties are centered in federal AI policy, and highlighted concerns with the Committee's first year report.
 - **Alexandra Givens**, Center for Democracy and Technology highlighted four priorities for the NAIAC to consider focusing on including: creating best practices guidance for responsible AI deployment, testing, and governance; establishing protocols for how and when federal agencies should report their AI usage and procurement policies; endorsing the AI Bill of Rights; and increasing capacity to respond to and debunk misinformation already bolstered by generative AI.
 - **Anna Tumadottir**, Deputy CEO and COO of Creative Commons remarked that AI is not a homogeneous technology, and any regulatory framework should be permissive of open innovation and also consider public benefits. Tumadottir discussed the iterative nature of creativity, drawing parallels to human creativity and generative AI. Adding that laws, tools, and norms outside of copyright should help address key concerns with these rapidly evolving systems.
 - **Vinhcent Le**, Senior Legal Counsel, Greenlining Institute provided background and examples of how datasets used in AI can lead to discrimination and outlined suggested actions the government can take to implement transparency and risk mitigation

requirements for AI systems, including critical or high-risk contexts, such as credit, housing, education, and employment.

- **Quinn Anex-Rios**, Policy Associate, Lawyers Committee for Civil Rights under Law discussed the NAIAC's Year 1 report and offered recommendations for the Committee to consider building on its year one recommendations for ensuring trustworthy, lawful, and open AI.
- **Amalea Smirniotopoulos**, Senior Policy Counsel, National Association for the Advancement for Colored People reiterated the need for preserving existing civil rights and suggested recommendations for the NAIAC and Law Enforcement Subcommittee to consider to help identify and reduce algorithmic discrimination.
- **Hannah Sassaman**, Executive Director, Peoples Tech Project voiced concern with several of the recommendations in the Committee's Year 1 report and suggested corrective actions for the Committee to consider moving forward.
- Fight for the Future had a last-minute conflict and could not attend virtually, but provided written comments, available at: nist.gov/itl/naiac-public-comments.

Question and Answer Session

- The NAIAC Executive Director thanked the presenters for their insights and invited Members to ask follow up questions from each presenter.
 - Presenters responded to a member's request to share information on each of the represented organization's efforts to offer AI technology literacy education to members and communities.
 - Members also invited presenters to call out what aspects of law enforcement technology the Law Enforcement Subcommittee should focus on and to suggest baselines they would use for quantifying algorithmic discrimination in law enforcement.
 - Members asked presenters to share thoughts on concrete next steps for the federal government to advance the blueprint for an AI Bill of Rights.

Closing Comments

- The NAIAC Chair closed the meeting by thanking everyone for their participation.
- The Designated Federal Officer adjourned the meeting at 2:58 pm Eastern Time.