National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee
Briefing Minutes
June 27, 2023

The National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee (NAIAC) held a virtual public briefing from 3:30 - 4:30 pm on Thursday, June 27, 2023. The briefing was recorded and is [available online](#).

NAIAC Committee Members:

- Miriam Vogel, Chair
- Amanda Ballantyne
- David Danks
- Victoria Espinel
- Susan Gonzales
- Ayanna Howard

- Ramayya Krishnan
- Liz O'Sullivan
- Fred Oswald
- Swami Sivasubramanian
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian
- Reggie Townsend

Law Enforcement Subcommittee Members:

- Jane Baumbauer, Chair
- Armando Aguilar
- Anthony Bak
- Esha Bhandari

- Jennifer Eberhardt
- Farhang Heydari
- Cynthia Rudin

NIST Staff Members Present

- Elham Tabassi, NIST
- Kathy Pham, NIST
- Melissa Taylor, NIST
- Rachel Trello, (acting) Designated Federal Officer (DFO), NIST

Invited Briefers

- Erica Fein, Government Affairs Specialist, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers
- Brett Gibson, Legislative Representative American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
- Eric Gottwald, Policy Specialist, Trade and Economic Globalization, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
- Faraz Khan, Labor Researcher, International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers
- Dan Mauer, Director of Government Affairs, Communications Workers of America
- Michael Wasser, Assistant to the President and Legislative Director, Department of Professional Employees
- Rob Weil, Director of Field Programs, American Federation of Teachers

Meeting Minutes (Session 2)
Held from 3:30 - 4:30 pm Eastern Time

Opening Remarks
- The Designated Federal Officer called the meeting to order at 3:34 PM Eastern Time and confirmed the committee is operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act and accessible to the public via livestream.

- NAIAC Executive Director, Kathy Pham, welcomed the session participants and explained the goal of NAIAC: to provide advice to the President of the United States and the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative Office on matters related to the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative. Pham added that biographical information of members of the newly-formed Law Enforcement Subcommittee can be found at www.ai.gov/naiac

- Miriam Vogel (Chair) thanked the panel of invited speakers for sharing their expertise and insights and informed viewers that the NAIAC Year 1 Report is available at the NAIAC website: www.ai.gov/naiac.

- Vogel introduced the Year 2 NAIAC working groups:
    - Engagement, Education and Inclusion (led by Reggie Townsend and Susan Gonzales);
    - AI Futures: Sustaining Innovation in NextGen AI (led by Ramayya Krishnan and Haniyeh Mahmoudian);
    - AI in Work and the Workforce (led by Trooper Sanders);
    - AI Regulation and Executive Action (led by Daniel Ho and Victoria Espinel);
    - Generative and NextGen AI: Safety and Assurance (led by Paula Goldman and David Danks);
    - Rights-Respecting AI (led by Janet Haven and Liz O'Sullivan);
    - International Arena: Collaboration on AI Policy and AI-Enabled Solutions (led by Victoria Espinel);
    - and the Law Enforcement Subcommittee (led by Jane Bambauer).

Presenter Remarks
- Presenters were invited to give three minutes of prepared remarks to the Committee. Each of the presenter's remarks may be viewed in full in the accompanying recording of the briefing. (Watch Remarks)
    - **Eric Gottwald**, Policy Specialist, Trade and Economic Globalization, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations discussed the AFL-CIO's interest in trade and raised concerns with commitments the U.S. is making with respect to digital trade.

    - **Rob Weil**, Director of Field Programs, American Federation of Teachers outlined the benefits and concerns with AI in the classroom and shared AFT's eleven core concepts that they recommend using to inform how AI is integrated into the classroom.

    - **Dan Mauer**, Director of Government Affairs, Communications Workers of America provided background on CWA's membership and highlighted concerns they have heard for their Members regarding AI.

- **Michael Wasser**, Assistant to the President and Legislative Director, Department of Professional Employees offered feedback for the Committee to consider on the NAIAC's year-one report for improving the Committee's recommendations related to immigration.

- **Erica Fein**, Government Affairs Specialist, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers expressed optimism in the Committee's ability to provide recommendations to shape high-quality standards for workers impacted by AI and offered to provide the Committee with access to worker testimony.

- **Faraz Khan**, Labor Researcher, International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers discussed AI's impact on IFPTE's members in the public sector and offered reaction and feedback on the NAIAC's first year report.

- **Brett Gibson**, Legislative Representative American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations echoed concerns previously raised regarding digital trade policies and called for the U.S. to prioritize domestic legislation and regulation prior to obligating the U.S. to international agreements.

Question and Answer Session

- The NAIAC Executive Director thanked the presenters for their insights and invited Members to ask follow up questions from each presenter.
    - Members called on presenters to expand on their presentations and provide details about trainings their respective organizations offer to workers impacted by AI.
    - Members invited presenters to discuss the impacts of algorithmic management, such as performance monitoring, on workers; as well as the impacts of worker surveillance on worker's attempts to organize.
    - Members also asked presenters to offer thoughts on what the threshold should be for deciding when to ask for worker consent to use minor or inconsequential applications of AI. As well as if their organizations have built frameworks for how to structure ways of engaging human and worker input in operationalizing AI.

Closing Comments

- The NAIAC Chair thanked everyone for their work, insights, and participation and invited the speakers to continue this conversation after the session and share feedback in more detail.

- The Designated Federal Officer adjourned the meeting at 4:30 pm Eastern Time.