National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee
Meeting Minutes
July 19, 2023

The National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee (NAIAC) held a virtual public meeting from 2:00 - 3:30 pm on Wednesday, July 19, 2023. The briefing was recorded and is available online.

NAIAC Committee Members:
- Miriam Vogel, Chair
- Amanda Ballantyne
- David Danks
- Victoria Espinel
- Susan Gonzales
- Paula Goldman
- Dan Ho
- Ayanna Howard
- Jon Kleinberg
- Ashley Llorens
- Christina Montgomery
- Liz O'Sullivan
- Keith Strier
- Navrina Singh
- Reggie Townsend

Law Enforcement Subcommittee Members:
- Jane Baumbauer, Chair

NIST Staff Members Present
- Elham Tabassi, NIST
- Kathy Pham, NIST
- Rachel Trello, (acting) Designated Federal Officer (DFO), NIST

Meeting Minutes
Held from 2:00 - 3:30 pm Eastern Time

Opening Remarks
- The Designated Federal Officer called the meeting to order at 2:10 PM Eastern Time and confirmed the committee is operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act and accessible to the public via livestream.

- NAIAC Executive Director, Kathy Pham, welcomed the Committee Members and thanked them for their continued service to advise President of the United States and the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative Office on matters related to the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative.

- Miriam Vogel (Chair) thanked the public for joining the meeting and the Members for their continued efforts. Vogel discussed the Committee's plan to host more meeting in year two of the Committee's work to better maintain pace with the field of AI.

- Vogel discussed the Committee's operating model for year two, noting the Committee plans to hold more public briefings and panel discussions with invited experts during year two. Adding that the Committee plans to reassess its working group structure and deliverables after 6-months and welcomes public feedback on how the Committee can be helpful in fulfilling its mission to advise the President and National Artificial Intelligence Initiative Office on AI policy.

Debrief on Briefing Sessions

- Vogel provided a brief overview of the briefing sessions the NAIAC held in June 2023, noting that the agenda and minutes for the briefings are available on the Committee's website (ai.gov/naiac).

- Members remarked on the different professional backgrounds and experiences of briefers emphasized the importance of diversity and inclusion of different perspectives in the NAIAC's work.

- Members remarked on the contrasting opinions of the briefers the Committee heard from, but noted a common interest among all the briefers to identify ways of involving impacted communities in the design phase of AI and ensure that impacted individuals have control over their data.

- Members urged the Committee to continue its efforts to learn and draw from the rich expertise from across the US.

Working Group Updates

- The *AI Futures: Sustaining Innovation in Next Gen AI* working group announced a series of public briefings. The briefings will explore technology risks and opportunities, steps the U.S needs to take to prepare society for an AI future, and opportunities for investment to ensure the U.S. leadership in AI.

- Members of the *AI in Work and the Workforce Working Group* shared updates on their efforts to build on their first-year focus on improving workforce data and understanding of how technological changes in AI will impact the workforce, algorithmic management to protect worker dignity, and supporting workers adapting to the technology and changes to their career.

- The *AI Regulation and Executive Action Working Group* discussed the groups recent activities, including a non-decisional explainer the group is drafting on the AI regulation debate to help clarify and provide background on the distinct harms of AI systems, types of regulatory interventions that are being considered, and articulate the consensus challenges with applying regulatory measures to AI. (Read the Document.)

- The *Engagement, Education and Inclusion Working Group* outlined their framing assumptions, and expressed concern that insufficient knowledge about the risks and rewards associated with AI, has disadvantaged American public to make informed choices about AI. The working group is gathering information to develop recommendations that foster broad based, accessible, AI literacy that can equip the

American public with tools and knowledge to make informed choices on when and how they interact with AI technologies.

- The *Generative & NextGen AI: Safety and Assurance Working Group* discussed the working group's upcoming deliverables, to include a non-decisional FAQ on foundation models and generative AI to help the working group establish shared definitions and answer commonly asked questions about the technology itself. ([Read the Document](#)). The working group is also investigating ideas around open source and further exploration into new risks and potential benefits of the technology.

- The *Rights-Respecting AI Working Group* outlined their proposals and discussed the focus areas the working group plans to pursue over the next year. The working group also offered examples of negative harms AI can have on creators and content moderators; adding discussion on potential recommendations the group are considering.

- The *International Arena: Collaboration on AI policy & AI-enabled Solutions Working Group* summarized the core themes underpinning their work; noting an opportunity to broaden international cooperation and dialogue by bringing countries not currently engaged in the global discussion into the conversation. Members of the group reiterated the need for effective AI governance and emphasized importance of including emerging countries in prominent forums on AI.

- The *Procurement of AI systems Working Group* discussed the government's role as a purchaser and user of AI, asserting that conventional government procurement systems that occur over several years do not work well for procuring AI. The working group went on to discuss opportunities they are investigating to promote responsible AI practices in the procurement process.

Introduction of the NAIAC Law Enforcement Subcommittee

- The NAIAC Chair introduced the NAIAC Law Enforcement Subcommittee (NAIAC-LE) Chair, Jane Bambauer.

- The NAIAC-Le Chair shared updated the NAIAC on the deliverables and areas of focus the subcommittee intends to explore as it begins its work. Among its deliverables, the subcommittee intends to develop a roadmap to ground the scope and objectives of the subcommittee's focus.

Committee Discussion of Non-Decisional Materials and Vote on Recommendations

- Kathy Pham (NIST) discussed the Committee's process for producing and sharing non-decisional work products. Non-decisional documents have been drafted by the

Committee's working groups for the purposes of explaining concepts or providing background and are not recommendations by the NAIAC.

- The NAIAC Chair motioned a vote on the *International Arena: Collaboration on AI policy & AI-enabled Solutions Working Group's* recommendation for participation of emerging economies in a global AI summit and invited the Working Group to present a summary of the recommendation to the Committee. ([Read Document](#))

Committee Vote to Advance Committee Recommendation for Participation of Emerging Economies in a Global AI Summit.

- In the presence of quorum, each Member of the Committee was polled and decided by majority vote to advance the recommendation.

Miriam Vogel - Yes	Jon Kleinberg - Yes
Amanda Ballantyne - Yes	Ashley Llorens - Yes
David Danks - Yes	Christina Montgomery - Yes
Victoria Espinel - Yes	Liz O'Sullivan - Yes
Paula Goldman - Yes	Navrina Singh - Yes
Susan Gonzales - Yes	Keith Strier - Yes
Daniel Ho - Yes	Reggie Townsend - Yes
Ayanna Howard - Yes	

Yes: 15 | No = 0

Wrap Up

- The Federal Register notice produced one public comment. The Committee opened the floor to audience questions virtually and in-person. Please see recording for public comments.

- The NAIAC Chair closed the meeting by thanking Members for a productive meeting and encouraged the public to join the next briefing session on August 3, 2023.

- The Designated Federal Officer adjourned the meeting at 3:30 pm Eastern Time.