

2023-08-03 NAIAC MEETING MINUTES

National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee
Federal Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes
August 3, 2023

The National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee (NAIAC) held a virtual public meeting on Thursday, August 3, 2023. The meeting was recorded and is [available online](#).

NAIAC Committee Members (Speakers Only):

- Victoria Espinel
- Anthony Bak
- Amanda Ballantyne
- Esha Bhandari
- David Danks
- Susan Gonzales
- Ramayya Krishnan
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian
- Liz O’Sullivan
- Fred Oswald
- Cynthia Rudin
- Reggie Townsend
- Miriam Vogel, Chair
- Janet Haven

NIST Staff Members Present:

- Kathy Pham, NAIAC Executive Director, NIST
- Rachel Trello, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), NIST

Invited Briefers

- Yoshua Bengio, Professor of Computer Science, University of Montreal
- Francesca Rossi, AI Ethics Global Leader, IBM; President, Association for the Advancement of Artificial Intelligence; Steering Committee Member, Global Partnership on AI
- Stuart Russell, Professor of Computer Science, University of California, Berkeley

Meeting Minutes

Welcome Remarks

- The Designated Federal Officer called the meeting to order at 12:05 PM Eastern Time and confirmed the NAIAC is operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act and accessible to the public via livestream.
- NAIAC Executive Director Kathy Pham welcomed the session participants and explained the goal of NAIAC: to provide advice to the President of the United States and the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative Office on matters related to the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative. Pham added that recordings and minutes of other NAIAC listening sessions are available online at <http://ai.gov/naiac> and that members of the public can contact NAIAC by emailing naiac@nist.gov.
- Miriam Vogel (Chair) briefly described NAIAC’s Year 1 Report and emphasized the importance of public listening sessions to inform NAIAC’s Year 2 work.

- Ramayya Krishnan (Co-Chair, AI Futures WG) welcomed invited guests to speak to the topic of how best to harness AI for the benefit of humanity.

Presenter Remarks

- Presenters were invited to give five minutes of prepared remarks to the NAIAC. Each presenter's remarks may be viewed in full in the accompanying recording of the briefing. ([Watch Remarks](#))
 - **Yoshua Bengio**, Professor of Computer Science, University of Montreal, summarized potentially catastrophic risks of powerful AI to democracy and national security and described his recommendations for regulation and research to reduce these risks.
 - **Francesca Rossi**, AI Ethics Global Leader, IBM, outlined principles of multistakeholder participation and transparency that government and private entities can embrace to capitalize on the benefits of AI while mitigating its risks.
 - **Stuart Russell**, Professor of Computer Science, University of California, Berkeley, emphasized the need for new ways to retain human control over powerful AI systems whose internal principles of operation are unclear.

Question and Answer Session

- Haniyeh Mahmoudian (Co-Chair, Futures AI WG) thanked the presenters for their insights and invited Members to ask follow-up questions of each presenter.
 - Members asked presenters for their thoughts on how to prepare society for the short- and long-term capabilities of AI models.
 - Members also asked presenters to identify potential future forms of AI technology of likely public importance, beyond current large language models.
 - Members observed that the presenters had emphasized the importance of removing harmful AI from use and asked about the regulatory timeline: should regulation follow release of potentially harmful AI systems or should it precede and prevent their release.

Closing Comments

- The NAIAC Chair thanked everyone for their work, insights, and participation and invited the speakers to continue the conversation in the coming months.
- The NAIAC Executive Director acknowledged the questions submitted to the chat and noted they would be posted with the meeting minutes.
- The Designated Federal Officer adjourned the meeting at 1:00 pm Eastern Time.