

National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee

Meeting Minutes

December 13, 2023

The National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee (NAIAC) held a virtual public meeting on Wednesday, December 13, 2023. The briefing was recorded and is available online.

NAIAC Members

- Amanda Ballantyne
- Jack Clark
- David Danks
- Victoria Espinel
- Susan Gonzalez
- Dan Ho
- Ayanna Howard
- Ashley Llorens
- James Manyika (Vice-Chair)
- Christina Montgomery
- Frank Pasquale
- Keith Strier
- Reggie Townsend
- Miriam Vogel (Chair)

NIST Staff Members

- Melissa Taylor, NIST
- Alicia Chambers, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), NIST

Meeting Minutes

Welcome Remarks

- Chambers called the meeting to order and confirmed that the committee is operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act and accessible to the public both in-person and via livestream. Time was reserved at the conclusion of the meeting for public questions. The Committee also received one written public comment.
- Taylor welcomed NAIAC members and thanked them for their service advising the President and the National AI Initiative Office while also informing the public. Taylor thanked members of the public for their participation and shared the NAIAC [email](#) and [mailing list](#).
- Vogel thanked NIST staff for their support and NAIAC members for their participation. Vogel then introduced the meeting agenda: (1) Committee deliberation and vote on a recommendation on the NIST U.S. AI Safety Institute (AIS) and (2) working group (WG) reflections on Executive Order 14110 (EO), including guidance WGs plan to develop to support its implementation.

Deliberation and Vote on Draft Recommendation

Implementation of the NIST AISI

- Vogel introduced the recommendation, which calls on the United States to continue leading the development of methods, standards, and frameworks for AI safety, and highlights the

important role the U.S. AISI will play in this effort. The recommendation underscores the importance of adequately resourcing the AISI and identifies several key work areas for the AISI, including accountability methodologies, standards for authenticating AI-generated content, and methods for facilitating adoption of NIST’s AI Risk Management Framework (RMF) across a range of organizational contexts.

- Vogel invited NAIAC members to discuss *Implementation of the NIST AISI*.
- Members noted that the recommendation emphasizes the need for the AISI – as part of a neutral, independent federal agency – to set the agenda on the development of AI safety frameworks and standards in the United States.
 - The AISI is developing a Consortium of partners across academia, industry, and civil society. Members recognized the value of collaboration between AISI and Consortium partners but reiterated that the AISI must lead AI safety efforts.
 - The recommendation emphasizes that AISI can only fill this leadership role if it has adequate resources, including full-time researchers, support staff, and computing capacity. The recommendation provides models for the scale of resources required, citing the funding allocated to development of a UK AI safety institute, as well as funding for United States institutions such as the Advanced Research Projects Agency for Health (ARPA-H) and the National Center for Atmospheric Research.
- Members agreed that the recommendation should call for the AISI to prioritize equity and inclusion in its work. The recommendation will be edited to do this in three ways:
 - Calling for the AISI to develop measurement standards and frameworks for the human and societal impacts of AI.
 - Highlighting the particular importance of considering those who are underrepresented or who have been historically marginalized.
 - Citing previous NAIAC deliverables that further discuss the Committee’s fundamental priority on equity and inclusion, and its consequent call for sociotechnical research and evaluation methods.
- The NAIAC Chair motioned a vote on *Implementation of the NIST AISI*. In the presence of quorum, each Member of the Committee was polled and decided by majority vote to advance the recommendation.

- Miriam Vogel – Approve w/ edits
- James Manyika – Approve w/ edits
- Amanda Ballantyne – Approve w/ edits
- Sayan Chakraborty – Not present
- Jack Clark – Approve w/ edits
- David Danks - Approve w/ edits
- Victoria Espinel – Approve w/ edits
- Paula Goldman – Not present

- Susan Gonzales - Approve w/ edits
- Janet Haven – Not present
- Daniel Ho - Approve w/ edits
- Ayanna Howard – Approve w/ edits
- Jon Kleinberg – Not present
- Ramayya Krishnan – Not present
- Ashley Llorens – Approve w/ edits
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian – Not present

-
- | | |
|--|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Christina Montgomery – Approve w/ edits• Liz O’Sullivan – Not present• Fred Oswald – Not present• Frank Pasquale – Approve w/ edits | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Trooper Sanders – Not present• Navrina Singh – Not present• Swami Sivasubramanian – Not present• Keith Strier – Approve w/ edits• Reggie Townsend – Approve w/ edits |
|--|--|
-

Approve with edits: 14 | Not present/no response: 11

WG Discussion of the EO

- At the November 15 NAIAC public meeting, members approved a statement voicing support for the EO, outlining directions for further progress, and expressing enthusiasm that the EO adopts recommendations from the NAIAC Year 1 Report.
- Members noted that the EO incorporates several recommendations from the NAIAC [Year 1 Report](#), including the designation of Chief AI Officers (CAIOs), establishment of a White House AI Council, and development of the National AI Research Resource (NAIRR).
- Vogel invited WGs to reflect further on the EO by raising any questions or comments about its contents and sharing guidance that might be developed to support government implementation of EO mandates.

Education/Awareness WG

- The Education/Awareness WG passed a recommendation titled [Enhancing AI Literacy for the United States of America](#) at the November 15 NAIAC public meeting.
- The EO primarily focuses on AI education and literacy initiatives for federal personnel, whereas the WG’s AI literacy recommendation proposes an initiative for the general public.
- The WG plans to review the sections of the EO that address education or AI literacy to identify ways in which the WG’s AI literacy recommendation might support the EO’s implementation.

International Collaboration WG

- In its recent work, the WG has focused on increasing awareness of the perspectives of emerging economies: in August 2023, the WG developed a [recommendation](#) calling for inclusion of emerging economies in global AI summits, and in November 2023 it held an expert briefing on AI-related benefits and challenges in Latin America.
- The WG plans also to identify aspects of the EO with international implications on which it might offer guidance (e.g., increasing international awareness of the NIST AI RMF).

Safety, Trust, and Rights WG

- In October 2023, NAIAC passed a recommendation on [procurement](#) that is germane to procurement provisions in the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) memorandum that accompanies the EO.

- The OMB memo requires agencies to conduct equity assessments when acquiring AI products. The WG is considering a recommendation on the kinds of data needed to conduct such equity assessments.
- The WG is reviewing the EO to identify additional areas in which its work might support implementation of EO mandates related to privacy, safety, equity, and civil rights.
- The WG is also developing a workshop on data transparency, to be held early in 2024.

AI in Work and the Workforce WG

- Representatives of the AI in the Work and the Workforce WG were not available to comment on the WG's plans to address the EO and OMB memo.

AI Futures WG

- Representatives of the AI Futures WG were not available to comment on the WG's plans to address the EO and OMB memo.

Closing Remarks

- Vogel thanked Committee members for sharing their expertise to support the federal government as it navigates rapid developments in AI. She also thanked members for their commitment to equity and inclusion, and for developing inclusive recommendations that work to ensure that the general public – particularly underrepresented communities – benefits from the opportunities offered by AI.
- Manyika thanked Vogel for her leadership, and both Vogel and Manyika thanked the Department of Commerce and NIST staff for facilitating NAIAC's work.
- During the meeting, members of the public shared four comments with NAIAC and NAIAC-LE. Members of the public are encouraged to share comments and questions with NAIAC and NAIAC-LE by emailing NAIAC@nist.gov. They can visit ai.gov/naiac to subscribe for Committee updates. A summary of the meeting will also be posted on ai.gov/naiac.
- Chambers adjourned the meeting at 1:54 PM Eastern Time.